

**2009 Midwest Clinic
Exploring the Core Repertoire for High School Band**

**Dr. Brian Cardany, University of Rhode Island
Dr. Paul Cummings, California State University - Humboldt**

**Thursday, December 17 11:30-12:30 Rm. W181
Friday, December 18 1:00-2:00 Rm. W181**

A Comprehensive List of Criteria for Selecting Band Repertoire

Here is a list of criteria that might be used in selecting band repertoire. The list is divided into two categories:

- Criteria for Determining Artistic Merit
- Criteria for Determining Functional and/or Pedagogical Merit

Sources are cited in parenthesis following each item, with a key to sources at the end of the document. A shorter list of the presenters' own recommended criteria will be presented at the Midwest sessions.

I. Criteria for Determining Artistic Merit

1. The composition has form – not “a form,” but form – and reflects a proper balance between repetition and contrast. (AO)
2. The composition reflects shape and design, and creates the impression of conscious choice and judicious arrangement on the part of the composer. (AO)
3. The composition reflects craftsmanship in orchestration, demonstrating a proper balance between transparent and tutti scoring, and also between solo and group colors. (AO)
4. The composition is sufficiently unpredictable to preclude an immediate grasp of its musical meaning. (AO)
5. The route through which the composition travels in initiating its musical tendencies and probable musical goals is not completely direct and obvious. (AO)
6. The composition is consistent in its quality throughout its length and various sections. (AO)
7. The composition is consistent in its style, reflecting a complete grasp of technical details, clearly conceived ideas, and avoids lapses into trivial, futile or unsuitable passages. (AO)
8. The composition reflects ingenuity in its development, given the stylistic context in which it exists. (AO)

9. The composition is genuine in idiom, and is not pretentious. (AO)
10. The composition reflects a musical validity that transcends factors of historical importance, or factors of pedagogical usefulness. (AO)
11. Does the piece have development? (FA)
 - A. Melodic development
 - B. Rhythmic development
 - C. Harmonic development
12. Is the orchestration appropriate to the piece's artistic message? (FA)
13. Is the piece unpredictable enough to avoid being classified as trite? (FA)
14. Does the piece allow for any personal musical judgment? (FA)
 - A. For conductor
 - B. For players
15. Is the piece evocative: (FA)
 - A. Programmatic or impressionistic
 - B. Derivative of or related to another art form
 - C. Abstract
16. Does the piece have musical integrity? (LC)
17. Are there good melodies, harmonies, and textures? (LC)
18. Is the percussion writing musical and logical? (LC)
19. Will our audience benefit from hearing this piece? (LC)
20. Will I benefit from studying, rehearsing, and conducting this piece? (LC)
21. Is this piece one of the finest examples of its type in the repertoire? (LC)
22. Does the music have a well-conceived formal structure? (RC)
23. Does the music have creative melodies and counterlines? (RC)
24. Does the music have harmonic imagination? (RC)
25. Does the music have rhythmic vitality? (RC)
26. Does the music have contrast in all musical elements? (RC)
27. Does the music have scoring that represents the full potential for beautiful tone and timbre? (RC)
28. Does the music have an emotional impact? (RC)

29. The music has lasting interest and value—“Good music wears well”—deserves to be repeated. (JL)

30. The music displays technical achievement—well put together, exhibits knowledge, skill, and craftsmanship. (JL)

31. The music has originality—“not obvious, clichéd, or trite.” (JL)

32. The music has expressiveness. (JL)

Selected quotations from leading conductors and composers regarding artistic merit criteria...

33. “The music should contain a variety of key centers, use of non-diatonic melodies, use of non-triadic harmony, accompaniment not restricted to *ostinato*, texture (transparent and full), contrasts and unpredictability, counterpoint, transitions.” (JS)

34. “The music must possess qualities that are beyond surface examination. Instant accessibility—an attribute so desired in contemporary society—is not the norm. There must be potential for continued insight as the work is further examined.” (WB)

35. “Often the work may pose questions, not provide answers. Art has substance, entertainment does not possess qualities that are lasting.” (WB)

36. “The *musical* value of wind band literature must be determined in the same manner as in orchestral, choral, and chamber music—musics of the concert hall. To be deemed truly significant, the work must compare favorably with the other masterworks, using relevant critical standards.” (WB)

37. “It must possess balanced qualities of unity, intensity, and complexity. The music must be enduring, not fleeting, seeking to enrich the human condition.” (WB)

38. “There are two constants in all great music, direction and originality.” (FM)

39. “Composers often search for a deliberate balance between order and freedom; unity and abundance; predictability and surprise. No magic formula can show the way to balance these elements, but that is a good thing.” (FT)

40. “You’re looking for an original voice, you’re looking for craft, you’re looking for a composer or arranger that really knows her stuff, and you’re looking for integrity in the structures.” (TB)

41. “You’re looking for integrity in the form of the work, that it’s justifiable. It’s not just a succession of clichés. It’s not a stringing together of effects like movie-music.” (TB)

42. “You’re looking for something that has a purpose, so you can say “why did the music do what it did?” At its best, music goes beyond something you can put into words.” (TB)

43. “You’re looking for variety, a harmonic language that maintains interest, instrumentation, and, more

than anything else, the avoidance of clichés.” (JC)

44. “You’re looking for scoring practices. How are voices being used? So often with wind music, we have too much tutti playing.” (JC)

45. “I also look at melodic character and for melodies that are not predictable. Not only melodies, but harmonies and rhythms that are not predictable.” (JC)

II. Criteria for Determining Functional and/or Pedagogical Merit

1. Are the skills attainable and is the instrumentation appropriate for my ensemble? (WM)
2. Examine scores carefully and use the following guidelines for selection: (WM)
 - a. Key centers
 - b. Variety of time signatures
 - c. Traditional and contemporary notation
 - d. Historical periods
 - e. Musical genres
 - f. Forms
 - g. Tempos
 - h. Length
 - i. Cultures
 - j. Difficulty for individual sections
 - k. “Teachable Moments” in the work
3. Does the piece fit into an overall scheme of balanced musical styles? (FA)
4. Does the piece introduce or reinforce any musical element(s)? (FA)
 - A. Theory
 1. Key
 2. Meter
 3. Harmonic palette/chord function
 4. Symbols
 - B. Musicology
 1. Historical background
 2. Form
 - C. Musicianship
5. Will my students benefit from working on this piece? (LC)
6. Are there opportunities for expressive playing? (LC)
7. Are there a variety of keys, styles, meters, and technical complexity? (LC)
8. Does the piece “fit” the group? (LC)

9. Is a good full score available? (LC)
10. Can we cover all the percussion parts? (LC)
11. Will this piece help develop solo skills in my ensemble? (LC)
12. Do we have adequate time to learn this piece? (LC)
13. Can we play this piece without major substitutions? (LC)
14. Can I meet any of the following needs with a particular piece? (PC)
 - a. Contains non-traditional notation, special instrumental effects, or singing?
 - b. Represents an unusual compositional source: non-Western music, female composer, etc.?
15. Compositions must contain important musical constructs necessary for the development of musicianship. (TD)
16. Compositions must exhibit an orchestration that, within the restrictions associated with a particular grade level, encourages musical independence both of individuals and sections. (TD)
17. The music has complexity and challenge—musical challenge is as important as technical challenge. (JL)

Regarding a concert program as a whole...

18. Does the music provide opportunities for both expressive and technical playing? (PC)
19. Is there a balanced mixture of challenging and easier music? (PC)
20. Is the music varied in terms of style, period, texture, ethnicity, instrumentation, etc.? (PC)
21. Is there a balanced mixture of serious and lighter moods? (PC)
22. Does the piece fulfill a particular programming need? (LC)

Key to Sources

AO = Acton Ostling Jr.'s criteria

From Ostling's doctoral dissertation at the University of Iowa -1978

WM = Wendy McCallum's criteria

From a presentation called "Repertoire as Curriculum" given in Toronto, November 8, 2008

FA = Fred Allen's criteria

From Fred J. Allen, Director of Bands, SFASU

LC = Lynn Cooper's criteria
From his book, *Teaching Band & Orchestra*

RC = Ray Cramer's criteria
From "What Materials are You Going to Use to Teach 'About Music' 'Through Music' While 'Performing Music,'" *Teaching Music Through Performance in Band*, Vol.1, Richard Miles, ed. (Chicago: GIA Publications, 1997), 8.

JS = Jack Stamp's criteria
From Jack Stamp, "Composing Music That Educates," *Teaching Music Through Performance in Band*, Vol. 2, Richard Miles, ed. (Chicago: GIA Publications, 1998), 95.

TD = Thomas Dvorak's criteria
From Thomas L. Dvorak, *Best Music for Young Band* (New York: Manhattan Beach Music, 1986), 7.

JL = Joseph Labuta's criteria
From Joseph A. Labuta, *Teaching Musicianship in the High School Band* (Ft. Lauderdale, Fla.: Meredith Music Publications, 1972, 1997), 181-182.

WB = William Berz's criteria
From William Berz, "Evaluating Music in a Multifaceted World," *Journal of the World Association for Symphonic Bands and Ensembles* 7 (2000): 32.

PC = Paul Cummings' criteria
From "Selecting High-Quality Repertoire for High School Band" session at CMEA (California Music Educators Association) State Conference; March 16, 2007

FM = Francis McBeth's criteria
From W. Francis McBeth, "Perceiving Music: Personal Evaluation of Quality in Music," *The Instrumentalist*, 45, no.5, (Dec. 1990): 43.

FT = Frank Ticheli's criteria
From Deborah Sheldon, "The Difficult Art of Writing Creative Music for Young Bands," *The Instrumentalist* (July, 2003): 26.

TB = Timothy Broege's criteria
From Timothy Broege quoted in Ryan Nowlin, "A Composition for Middle School Band Based Upon Renowned Composers' Perspective of Writing for Beginning and Middle Level Students" (Masters Thesis, Bowling Green State University, 2004), 40-41.

JC = Jim Croft's criteria
From James Croft quoted in J.L. Casey, *Teaching Techniques and Insights for Instrumental Music Educators*, 2d ed. (Chicago: GIA Publications, 1993).

2009 Midwest Clinic
Exploring the Core Repertoire for High School Band

Dr. Brian Cardany, University of Rhode Island
 Dr. Paul Cummings, California State University - Humboldt

Thursday, December 17, 11:30-12:30, Rm. W181
 Friday, December 18, 1:00-2:00, Rm. W181

Core Repertoire List for High School Band

<u>Composer</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Grade</u>
Adams, John	<i>Grand Pianola Music</i>	6
Adler, Samuel	<i>A Little Night and Day Music</i>	4
Arnold, Malcolm	<i>Prelude, Siciliano and Rondo</i> (Paynter)	4
Arnold, Malcolm	<i>Four Scottish Dances</i> (Paynter)	5
Bach, J. S.	<i>Fantasia in G Major</i> (Goldman/Leist)	4
Bach, J. S.	<i>Come Sweet Death</i> (Reed)	3
Barnes, James	<i>Yorkshire Ballad</i>	3
Bartok, Bela	<i>Three Hungarian Songs</i> (Gordon)	2
Bassett, Leslie	<i>Designs, Images, and Textures</i>	6
Bassett, Leslie	<i>Colors and Contours</i>	5
Bennett, Robert Russell	<i>Suite of Old American Dances</i>	5
Benson, Warren	<i>Solitary Dancer</i>	5
Benson, Warren	<i>The Leaves are Falling</i>	6
Bernstein, Leonard	<i>Overture to "Candide"</i>	5
Brahms, Johannes	<i>Blessed Are They</i> (Buehlman)	3
Broege, Timothy	<i>Headless Horseman</i>	2
Broege, Timothy	<i>Rhythm Machine</i>	2
Broege, Timothy	<i>Three Pieces for American Band, Set #2</i>	3
Broege, Timothy	<i>Sinfonia V: Symphonia Sacra et Profana</i>	4
Bukvich, Daniel	<i>Symphony #1, In Memorium, Dresden, Germany, 1945</i>	4
Carter, Charles	<i>Overture for Winds</i>	3
Chance, John Barnes	<i>Variations on a Korean Folk Song</i>	4
Chance, John Barnes	<i>Elegy</i>	4
Chance, John Barnes	<i>Incantation and Dance</i>	4
Chen Yi	<i>Spring Festival</i>	3
Colgrass, Michael	<i>The Winds of Nagual</i>	6
Colgrass, Michael	<i>Old Churches</i>	2
Copland, Aaron	<i>Down a Country Lane</i> (Patterson)	3
Copland, Aaron	<i>Emblems</i>	6
Corigliano, John	<i>Gazebo Dances</i>	6
Creston, Paul	<i>Celebration Overture</i>	5
Custer, Callvin	<i>Variations on "Scarborough Fair"</i>	2
Daehn, Larry	<i>As Summer Was Just Beginning</i>	3
Dahl, Ingolf	<i>Sinfonietta</i>	6
Del Borgo, Elliot	<i>Do Not Go Gentle Into That Good Night</i>	5
Dello Joio, Norman	<i>Scenes from "The Louvre"</i>	4
Dello Joio, Norman	<i>Variants on a Medieval Tune</i>	5

<u>Composer</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Grade</u>
Duncombe, W.	<i>Early English Suite</i> (Finlayson)	2
Erickson, Frank	<i>Balladair</i>	2
Erickson, Frank	<i>Air for Band</i>	3
Erickson, Frank	<i>Toccata for Band</i>	3
Giannini, Vittorio	<i>Fantasia for Band</i>	4
Giannini, Vittorio	<i>Symphony No. 3</i>	5
Gorb, Adam	<i>Yiddish Dances</i>	5
Gould, Morton	<i>Mini Suite</i>	2
Gould, Morton	<i>Ballad for Band</i>	5
Gould, Morton	<i>Symphony No. 4 "West Point"</i>	5
Grainger, Percy	<i>Ye Banks and Braes O' Bonnie Doon</i>	3
Grainger, Percy	<i>Irish Tune from County Derry</i>	4
Grainger, Percy	<i>Shepherd's Hey</i>	4
Grainger, Percy	<i>Colonial Song</i>	5
Grainger, Percy	<i>Lincolnshire Posy</i>	6
Grainger, Percy	<i>Children's March</i>	5
Grainger, Percy	<i>Handel in the Strand</i> (Goldman)	4
Grainger, Percy	<i>Molly on the Shore</i>	5
Gregson, Edward	<i>Festivo</i> (Reynish)	4
Grundman, Clare	<i>Kentucky 1800</i>	2
Grundman, Clare	<i>Little Suite for Band</i>	2
Handel, Georg F.	<i>Music for the Royal Fireworks</i>	5
Hansen, Howard	<i>Chorale and Alleluia</i>	4
Hanson, Howard	<i>Dies Natalis</i>	4
Hanson, Howard	<i>Laude</i>	4
Hartley, Walter	<i>Sinfonia No. 4</i>	5
Hindemith, Paul	<i>Symphonic Metamorphosis</i> (Wilson)	6
Hindemith, Paul	<i>Symphony in B-flat</i>	6
Holsinger, David	<i>A Childhood Hymn</i>	2
Holsinger, David	<i>On a Hymnsong of Philip Bliss</i>	3
Holst, Gustav	<i>First Suite in E-flat</i>	4
Holst, Gustav	<i>Second Suite in F</i>	4
Holst, Gustav	<i>Hammersmith</i>	5
Husa, Karel	<i>Apotheosis of This Earth</i>	6
Husa, Karel	<i>Music for Prague 1968</i>	6
Husa, Karel	<i>Al Fresco</i>	5
Husa, Karel	<i>Smetana Fanfare</i>	5
Iannaccone, Anthony	<i>After a Gentle Rain</i>	5
Ives, Charles	<i>Country Band March</i> (Sinclair)	5
Ives, Charles	<i>Old Home Days</i> (Elkus)	4
Ives, Charles	<i>Variations on "America"</i> (Schuman/Rhoads)	5
Jacob, Gordon	<i>Giles Farnaby Suite</i>	3

<u>Composer</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Grade</u>
Jacob, Gordon	<i>An Original Suite</i>	4
Jacob, Gordon	<i>William Byrd Suite</i>	5
Jacob, Gordon	<i>Music for a Festival</i>	4
Jadin, Louis	<i>Symphonie for Band</i> (Schaeffer)	4
La Plante, Pierre	<i>American Riversongs</i>	3
Latham, William	<i>Three Chorale Preludes</i>	4
Lo Presti, Ronald	<i>Elegy for a Young American</i>	4
Mahr, Timothy	<i>Fantasia in G</i>	4
Margolis, Bob	<i>Color</i>	4
Margolis, Bob	<i>Fanfare, Ode, and Festival</i>	2
Maslanka, David	<i>A Child's Garden of Dreams</i>	6
McBeth, W. Francis	<i>Chant and Jubilo</i>	3
McBeth, W. Francis	<i>Kaddish</i>	4
McGinty, Anne	<i>The Red Balloon</i>	2
Mendelssohn, Felix	<i>Overture for Winds, Op. 24</i>	5
Mennin, Peter	<i>Canzona</i>	5
Milhaud, Darius	<i>Suite Francaise</i>	5
Nelhybel, Vaclav	<i>Symphonic Movement</i>	5
Nelson, Ron	<i>Courtly Airs and Dances</i>	4
Nelson, Ron	<i>Medieval Suite</i>	4
Nelson, Ron	<i>Morning Alleluias for a Winter Solstice</i>	4
Paulson, John	<i>Epinicion</i>	4
Persichetti, Vincent	<i>Pageant</i>	4
Persichetti, Vincent	<i>Divertimento</i>	5
Persichetti, Vincent	<i>Serenade for Band</i>	4
Persichetti, Vincent	<i>Symphony No. 6</i>	5
Persichetti, Vincent	<i>Psalm for Band</i>	4
Reed, Alfred	<i>Armenian Dances Part I</i>	5
Reed, Alfred	<i>A Festival Prelude</i>	4
Reed, Alfred	<i>Russian Christmas Music</i>	5
Reed, H. Owen	<i>La Fiesta Mexicana</i>	5
Respighi, Ottorino	<i>Huntingtower Ballad</i>	5
Saint-Saens, Camille	<i>Occident et Orient, op. 25</i>	5
Schmitt, Florent	<i>Dionysiaques</i>	6
Schoenberg, Arnold	<i>Theme and Variations</i>	6
Schuman, William	<i>Chester</i>	5
Schuman, William	<i>Be Glad Then, America</i>	5
Schuman, William	<i>George Washington Bridge</i>	5
Schuman, William	<i>When Jesus Wept</i>	5
Schwantner, Joseph	<i>...and the mountains rising nowhere</i>	6
Shostakovich, Dmitri	<i>Folk Dances</i> (Reynolds)	4
Shostakovich, Dmitri	<i>Festive Overture, Op. 96</i> (Hunsberger)	5
Stuart, Hugh	<i>A Hymn for Band</i>	2
Stuart, Hugh	<i>Three Ayres from Gloucester</i>	3
Susato, Tielman	<i>The Battle Pavane</i> (Margolis)	2

<u>Composer</u>	<u>Title</u>	<u>Grade</u>
Sweeney, Michael	<i>Ancient Voices</i>	2
Thomsen, Virgil	<i>A Solemn Music</i>	4
Ticheli, Frank	<i>Portrait of a Clown</i>	2
Ticheli, Frank	<i>Shenandoah</i>	3
Ticheli, Frank	<i>Cajun Folk Songs</i>	4
Ticheli, Frank	<i>Amazing Grace</i>	3
Ticheli, Frank	<i>Fortress</i>	4
Ticheli, Frank	<i>Blue Shades</i>	5
Ticheli, Frank	<i>An American Elegy</i>	4
Ticheli, Frank	<i>Loch Lomond</i>	3
Ticheli, Frank	<i>Postcard</i>	5
Tschesnokoff, Pavel	<i>Salvation is Created</i>	4
Tull, Fisher	<i>The Final Covenant</i>	5
Tull, Fisher	<i>Sketches on a Tudor Psalm</i>	5
Turina, Joaquin	<i>Five Miniatures (Krance)</i>	5
Turina, Joaquin	<i>La Procession du Rocio (Reed)</i>	5
Vaughan Williams, Ralph	<i>Flourish for Wind Band</i>	3
Vaughan Williams, Ralph	<i>Rhosymedre</i>	3
Vaughan Williams, Ralph	<i>English Folk Song Suite</i>	4
Vaughan Williams, Ralph	<i>Toccata Marziale</i>	5
Vaughan Williams, Ralph	<i>Linden Lea</i>	3
Vaughan Williams, Ralph	<i>Sea Songs</i>	4
Wagner, Richard	<i>Trauermusik (Votta/Boyd)</i>	4
Wagner, Richard	<i>Elsa's Procession to the Cathedral (Calliet)</i>	4
Whitacre, Eric	<i>October</i>	4
Williams, Clifton	<i>Variation Overture</i>	3
Wood, Haydn	<i>Mannin Veen</i>	5